Rhetoric and Poetry

in the First Part of Tamburlaine the Great

Minoru Shigeta*

Of the life of Christopher Marlowe very little is known. Marlowe was a shoemaker's son, born at Canterbury in 1564-two months earlier than Shakespeare at Stratford—and was educated at the King's School in that town. He entered Benet College, Cambridge, as a Pensioner, in 1581, and after taking his B. A. degree came up to seek his fortune in London, Marlowe took his Master's degree in 1587, and before this date Tamburlaine had been performed. The rest of his short life was spent in writing tragedies for money. What he gained by his pen he is said to have wasted among the frequenters of suburban taverns. His end was tragic: a rival in some love adventure stabbed him with his own dagger in a tavern at Deptford. This was in 1593, before the completion of his thirtieth year. If we assign the first part of Tamburlaine to 1587,1 this gives a period of some six years to Marlowe's activity as a dramatist. Within that brief space of time he successively produced the second part of Tamburlaine, Dr. Faustus, The Massacre at Paris, The Jew of Malta, and Edward II. These tragedies were performed during their author's lifetime; and though it is impossible to fix their order with any certainty, internal evidence of style justifies us in assigning the two lastnamed plays to be later years of his life, while the two parts of Tamburlaine are undoubtedly among the earliest fruits of his genius. At his death he left an unfinished drama on the tragedy of Dido, which I (i. e. J. A. Symonds) am inclined to refer to the beginning of his career as playwright.2

As we have seen, *The Tamburlaine the Great* seems to be Marlowe's first play. Then, what about the relation with *The Spanish Tragedy*? Douglas Cole says, "Marlowe's *Tamburlaine* and *The Spanish Tragedy* of Thomas Kyd have long been considered the major heralds of serious drama on the popular Elizabethan stage. These plays are generally considered to have appeared about simultaneously, but scholars have argued for dating *The Spanish Tragedy* as early as 1582, which would place it ahead of Marlowe's earliest dramatic work and therefore warrant a consideration of Kyd as one of Marlowe's predecessors."

Next we must consider the question whether the two parts of *Tamburlaine* form, for purposes of interpretation, one entity or two. The Prologue to Part II gives us Marlowe's own statement:

^{*} 宇部工業高等専門学校英語教室

The generall welcomes Tamburlain receiv'd,
When he arrived last upon our stage,
Hath made our Poet pen his second part,
Wher death cuts off the progres of his pomp,
And murdrous Fates throwes al his triumphs down.4

That is, plainly, the second part was not originally contemplated but was written as a result of the great popularity of the first part. "Hence," Kocher says, "the first part was designed as a seperate, self-subsisting play, and Marlowe's meaning in it must be sought within its own borders, not imported from the second part. Further confirmation, if any be needed, comes from the fact that Marlowe exhausted historical sources in the first part, as he would not have done had he been planning a continuation." Therefore in the following chapters, we will consider Marlowe's meaning in the first part of Tamburlaine the Great.

What precipitated Marlowe's attention on Tamburlaine? According to A. L. Rowse, it was the account of his in George Whetstone's *English Mirror* published in 1586, the year before Marlowe's play came to birth. "In this Marlowe found portrayed the greatest example in the modern world of the successful conqueror, the clear-eyed man who knew the gold to which he aspired and the means by which he might attain it." Tamburlaine (Timur the Lame), according to Whetstone, was consumed by "a ruling desire, i.e. the desire to rule. If there is one passage above all in Whetstone which might have stirred Marlowe to the choice of this theme, it seems to be this: "notwithstanding the poverty of his parents, even from his infancy he had a reaching and an imaginative mind; the strength and comeliness of his body answered the haughtiness of his heart." This is very apt to what we know or the general surmise of Marlowe.

Based on the Timur the Lame (1336-1405), it is a history or chronicle play interpreting the important events in the life of the Mongolian warrior who conquered the Turks at Ankara in 1402 and was regarded by many in the Christian West as a hero. The plot of this play is very simple; the character of Tamburlaine rules the action, and our other interests in the play are subordinate to our interest in his destiny. Thus if we want to understand the significance of Tamburlaine's actions, we must examine the concrete results they have, assess the nature of his motives and aspirations, and judge him accordingly. At the same time, we find the use of rhetoric and poetry throughout the play; Tamburlaine is a powerful rhetorician, a master of persuasion, and he is also a kind of poet. Therefore, if we examine the complex ways that rhetoric and poetry function in the play, we will come to the heart of Marlowe's intention with regard to his protagonist. From now on, we will examine in turn each of these considerations in the following chapters.

T

The first part of *Tamburlaine the Great* begins with the Prologue. It brings both the atmosphere of the time and Marlowe's idisyncratic temper before us:

From jygging vaines of riming mother wits,
And such conceits as clownage keepes in pay,
Wheele leade you to the stately tent of War:
Where you shall heare the Scythian Tamburlaine,
Threatning the world with high astounding tearms
And scourging kingdoms with his conquering sword.
View but his picture in this tragicke glasse,
And then applaud his fortunes if you please. (Prologue, 1-8)

Here Marlowe proclaims that he will depart from the undistinguished verse of the usual dramatic fare in order to present "the Scythian Tamburlaine, /Threatning the world with high astounding tearms/ And scourging kingdoms with his conquering sword." As Levin points out, "The lines break cleanly into hemistichs, which are bomboasted out by participial adjectives: "jygging" and "rhyming," "astounding" and "conquering." So the Prologue is the proud manifesto of a new poet conscious of bringing to tho public stage an unaccustomed dignity of theme and style. Marlowe is no more than twenty-three years old; and he has just come down from Cambridge to London; but it seems as if he tried to invade the theater like Tamburlaine whose conquests he has chosen to dramatize. We are asked to "View but his picture in this tragicke glasse, And then applaud his fortunes if you please." Though the dramatist prepares us for the adventure and spectacle, he seems to hint that we must carefully scrutinize the deeds of his protagonist, the phrase, "tragicke glass," tells us that the work treats its subject matter, but it also leads us to expect unhappiness and death in what follows. Thus the tragic implications are insisted upon from the first. The subtitle Richard Jones used in 1590 when he printed both parts of Tamburlaine the Great ("two tragicall Discourses") stresses the importance of the implications.

In the very first scene the importance of rhetoric to Tamburlaine is made clear. Mycetes, the cowardly King of Persia, displays his weakness as a monarch through an inadequate power to command words:

```
Brother Cosroe, I find my selfe agreev'd,
Yet insufficient to expresse the same:
For it requires a great and thundring speech: (I. i. 1-3)
```

Unlike Tamburlaine, the ridiculous and unsympathetic Mycetes soon suffers humiliating defeat. His brother Cosroe first subjects him to public criticism and scorn and then conspires with the Persian lords to depose him. Soon the noblemen crown Cosroe. Cosroe

accepts Mycetes' title in order to bring honor back to Persia and rid the land of its enemies, but he is to reign only a short time. Here we see the first of several symbolic crown-scenes dramatizing the passing of power from one man to another. Many crowns are either seized or given as prizes for valor during the play, but Tamburlaine eventually controls the wealth, the lands, and the men represented by them. "The symbolic values communicated by crown-scenes," Masinton argues, "form a part of the play's total symbolic content, the meaning of which runs counter to the poetry and rhetoric by which Tamburlaine obscures his monomania....Thus we are made to see the ironic disparity between the stirring sentiments of his speeches and the indefensible nature of his deeds." 10

The second scene shows Tamburlaine's remarkable attributes, and the figures of Mycetes and Cosroe seem to be smaller than they are. Tamburlaine tells Zenocrate that he intends to rule Asia and become "a terrour to the world," and asserts that he will rise above the humble station in life to which he was born. In the same scene (I. ii), we see Marlowe's enormous lyrical talents sparkle in the Tamburlaine's famous speech of enticement to Zenocrate:

Zenocrate, lovelier than the Love of Jove, Brighter than is the silver Rhodope. Fairer than whitest snow on Scythian hils, Thy person is more woorth to Tamburlaine, Than the possession of the Persean Crowne, Which gratious starres have promist at my birth. A hundred Tartars shall attend on thee, Mounted on Steeds, swifter than Pegasus. Thy Garments shall be made of Medean silke, Enchast with precious juelles of mine owne: More rich and valurous than Zenocrates. With milke-white Hartes upon an Ivorie sled, Thou shalt be drawen amidst the frosen Pooles, And scale the ysie mountaines lofty tops: Which with thy beautie will be soone resolv'd. My martiall prises with five hundred men, Wun on the fiftie headed Vuolgas waves, Shall all we offer to Zenocrate, (I. ii. 87-106) And then my selfe to faire Zenocrate.

Considering these lines, it may be concluded that Zenocrate is a reflection of the vision of ideal Beauty in Tamburlaine'a imagination, a vision that for him is synonymous with his dream of royal power and grandeur. At the same time, Zenocrate can be taken as "the symbol of his inner self or soul." 12

Tamburlaine's first clever use of rhetoric as a political tool occurs when Theridamas, commanding the Persian army to subdue Tamburlaine, confronts him on the field. After impressing Theridamas with his rich booty, Tamburlaine flatters him and quickly persuades him to join the conquering force. He says, "I hold the Fates bound fast in yron chaines, /And with my hand turne Fortunes wheel about." and claims to

have the divine protection of Jove. Tamburlaine's oratory produces awed admiration in Theridamas:

Not Hermes Prolocutor to the Gods, Could use perswasions more patheticall. (I. ii. 210-211)

II

In Act II, scenes ii and iii, we are allowed to compare the "woorking woordes" of Tamburlaine, as Theridamas calls them, with the ineffectual rhetoric of Mycetes, just before their two armies engage in combat. Mycetes cannot inspire his soldiers to bravery, but Tamburlaine boasts that the "Fates and Oracles of heaven" have promised him victory. He flatters his men by comparing them to the ancient heroes, and he promises to make them the rivals of the gods. When the fighting begins to go badly, Mycetes sneaks away from the battlefield and looks for a place to hide his crown (II. iv), but is confronted by Tamburlaine. Mycetes timidly hands the crown to his enemy for brief inspection, and Tamburlaine mocks Mycetes by announcing that in a short time he will win the crown in combat.

Tamburlaine, in scene v, offers the dead Mycetes' crown to Cosroe, but the new king grants it to Tamburlaine and makes him "Regent of Persea." Before saying good-by to Tamburlaine, Menaphon carelessly causes Tamburlaine's ambition to flare by reminding Mycetes that soon he will "ride in triumph through *Persepolis*." This slight description of the martial dignity creates in Tamburlaine's imagination an irresistible image of lordly splendor. So he challenges Cosroe to battle and, in scene vi, defeats him, snatching the crown away as Cosroe dies cursing his former ally.

The thirst of raigne and sweetnes of a crown,
That causde the eldest sonne of heavenly *Ops*,
To thrust his doting father from his chaire,
And place himselfe in the Emperiall heaven,
Moov'd me to manage arms against thy state.
What better president than mightie *Jove*? (II. vii. 12-17)

In these lines, Tamburlaine dignifies his rebellion by comparing it to the mythical revolt of the young gods against the ancient Titans. In the myth Jove wrenches control of heaven from his father Salturn, and Tamburlaine feels that by following Jove's course he fully justifies the attack on Cosroe, and continues his dogma:

Nature that fram'd us of four Elements, Warring within our breasts for regiment, Doth teach us all to have aspyring minds: Our soules, whose faculties can comprehend
The wondrous Architecture of the world:
And measure every wandering plannets course:
Still climing after knowledge infinite,
And alwaies mooving as the restles Spheares,
Wils us to weare our selves and never rest,
Untill we reach the ripest fruit of all,
That perfect blisse and sole felicitie,
The sweet fruition of an earthly crowne. (II. vii. 18 29)

As Masinton points out, "rebellion was considered a heinous crime and a grave sin in Elizabethan England."17 Moreover, his view of man as the inhabitant of a turbulent universe, as a proud, unruly creature whose aspiring intelligence and indomitable urge to rule is instilled in him by nature, it seems, was heresy to an Elizabethan. It is said that Englishmen were taught that God created an ordered universe and that man occupies a designated, fixed place in it. In other words, it is man's responsibility to preserve this order by keeping his station in life and supporting the existing social and political system. Therefore, if man should strive for anything within the system of order, it should be the spiritual crown of eternal bliss and not "an earthly crowne." In addition, his speech is the first and greatest of sins against God and the source of diabolismspiritual pride. Like Faustus, Tamburlaine reenacts the oldest of sins in attempting to usurp divine privileges. His striving for divinity gives the play a mythic character. Marlowe's intention is, it seems, to create in his protagonist an image with universal human significance. It may be that Marlowe's treatment of Tamburlaine here is regarded as "an artistic representation of man's inborn tendency to challenge authority, his instinctive assertion of his individuality in defiance of a moral law."18

III

Act III concentrates on Tamburlaine's defeat of Bajazeth, the Turkish Emperor. Interesting dramatic spectacles occur when Bajazeth and his subjects exchange threats and insults with Tamburlaine and his followers in Act III, scene iii. When Tamburlaine and Bajazeth go off to fight, Zenocrate and Zabina hold the crowns of their monarchs and "manage words" against each other while they await the outcome of the battle. They exchange scorn and pray to their gods for victory. But the ladies, like the men, overdo the scoffing and ridicule, and we are inclined to see them as the objects of Marlowe's satire in this scene. Their misuse of the language of prayer may be a faint reflection of Tamburlaine's profane habit of indiscriminately using his rhetoric with the names of Jove, God, Fortune to convince his hearers of his immortality and his divine mission to slay and subdue.

The most remarkable tragedy of the first part of *Tamburlaine the Great* is the fall of Bajazeth. He meets military defeat at the end of the third act; in the fourth,

he is humiliated by being carried about in a cage, used as a living footstool for Tamburlaine, and fed scraps from banquet table as though he were a dog. In his furious indignation, Bajazeth flings curse after curse at Tamburlaine, most of them framed in the imagery of hell, darkness, and the underworld. But even such prayers and curses are converted to the enhancement of Tamburlaine's superhuman stature as Bajazeth says:

Great *Tamburlaine*, great in my overthrow,
Ambitious pride shall make thee fall as low,
For treading on the back of *Bajazeth*,
That should be horsed on fower mightie kings. (IV. ii. 74-78)

The point of this emphasis on servitude and enslavement seems to be that, in Tamburlaine's world, one is either slave or free. For him, his competitors for power must be dead or enslaved. Bajazeth's cage, therefore, becomes a symbol of the absolute subordination which Tamburlaine must demand if he is to have absolute sovereignty.

The tragedy of Bajazeth and Zabina is worked out in three scenes (IV. ii, IV. iv, and V. i), with the destruction of Damascus as a backdrop. The tragedy of the city reflects the tragedy of the royal couple. As Tamberlaine's tents change their color from white (clemency), to red (selective execution), to black (total annihilation), so his treatment of the Turk becomes increasingly harsh, until Bajazeth is driven to suicide. Zabina, returning to find her husband dead, goes mad and kills herself. As Cole points out, Marlowe emphasizes the total incoherency and agitation of her delirious state by abandoning the rhythms of blank verse and throwing her disconnected phrases into prose form: Marlowe may be the first to use it in the tragic drama.

IV

Though Zenocrate twice asks Tamburlaine to spare Damascus, Tamburlaine refuses on both occasions to satisfy her request. And when Damascus ignores the warning signaled by brutal custom of flying white, red, and black flags on successive days to indicate his intentions, and waits until the third day to surrender, he destroys the city and kills all its inhabitants, including the four virgins the Governor sends out to offer submission and beg his mercy. Here we will recall the description of Tamburlaine's flag told by the messenger of Souldan.

The first day when he pitcheth downe his tentes, White is their hew, and on his silver crest A snowy Feather sprangled white he beares, To signify the mildnesse of his minde: That satiate with spoile refuseth blood. But when *Aurora* mounts the second time,

As red as scarlet is his his furniture,
Then must his kindled wrath bee quencht with blood,
Not sparing any that can manage armes.
But if these threats moove not submission,
Black are his collours, blacke Pavilion,
His speare, his shield, his horse, his armour, plumes,
And Jetty Feathers menace death and hell. (IV. i. 49-61)

In these lines, we see Marlowe's visual sense. As our critic comments, "his is not a subtle colour-sense. In all the range of both parts of *Tamburlaine* he speaks only of blood-red, black, gold, crystal, silver and milk-white. So startling and decorative are the effects that he achieves with these that we forget at first there is no mention in the whole ten acts of the green of grass, of the blue of the sky, or the browns, greys and violets of the English landscape."²¹

The words of the entreating virgins do not move Tamburlaine because "rhetoric is, for him, a function of power, useful as propaganda but not effective as a vehicle expressing human need."²² Here Marlowe intensifies the impact of this scene by another visual device; like the flag raised above his tents, Tamburlaine's clothes are black, the color of death and evil. Marlowe's visual sense, like his vision, is all the more intense and effective for being restricted. The idea and vision are what move Marlowe: "It is in the world of the ideas that lie behind these outward forms that he moves familiarly, and in the almost mystic utterance of the spirit itself...It is this quality in Marlowe's mind that, already in *Tamburlaine*, gives a curious chill, and austere effect, to a poetry which is, paradoxically, instinct with passion." ²³

Tamburlaine has no reason for murdering the young girls but spreads desolation only to make himself feared throughout the world. In a sense, Tamburlaine delights in frightening his victims. As soon as he hears of the virgins' deaths and orders the rest of the inhabitants killed, he utters the long, impassioned speech in which he praises Zenocrate's beauty and discourses on the nature of ideal beauty.

Ah faire Zenocrate, divine Zenocrate,
Faire is too foule an Epithite for thee,
That in thy passion for thy countries love,
And feare to see thy kingly Fathers harme,
With haire discheweld wip'st thy watery cheeks:
And like to Flora in her mornings pride,
Shaking her silver tresses in the aire,
Rain'st on the earth resolved pearle in showers,
And sprinklest Saphyrs on thy shining face,
Wher Beauty, mother to the Muses sits,
And comments vollumes with her Yvory pen:
Taking instructions from thy flowing eies,
Eies when that Ebena steps to heaven,
In silence of thy solemn Evenings walk,
Making the mantle of the richest night,

The Moone, the Planets, and the Meteors light.

There Angels in their christal armours fight
A doubtfull battell with my tempted thoughtes,
For Egypts freedom and the Souldans life:
His life that so consumes Zenocrate,
Whose sorrowes lay more siege unto my soule,
Than all my Army to Damascus walles.
And neither Perseans Soveraign, nor the Turk
Troubled my sences with conceit of foile,
So much by much, as dooth Zenocrate.

(V. i. 135-159)

Because these lines follow directly upon his most barbaric act, our disgust for the speaker increases. By bringing together the sacrifice of the virgins and Tamburlaine's poem of praise, Marlowe seems to tell us that the vision of royal magnificence that Zenocrate inspires in Tamburlaine results in the massacre and destruction that he causes when he tries to realize the vision. Indeed Tamburlaine is moved by the sight of Zenocrate's tears for her father, but he is more deeply affected by the sublime image of Beauty that her radiant loveliness brings in his soul. Tamburlaine in these passages (V. i. 135-190) takes the role of a poet, and we see some of Marlowe's finest lyrics. It seems that Tamburlaine is in love with the fame, valor, and victory that Zenocrate's beauty represents him, and the ardor stirred by his thoughts of her is expressed as a romantic lyric on ideal beauty.

After Tamburlaine defeats the forces of Souldan, the two are reconciled because Tamburlaine "hast with honor usde Zenocrate," 24 and a marriage is planned for Tamburlaine and Zenocrate. Tamburlaine places a crown on her head and makes her the queen of all the nations he has subdued. They stand at the top of happiness and success. But according to Masinton, 5 Marlowe adds an element of the grotesque to the romance pattern; peace has come only after great and pointless bloodshed, and the order that Tamburlaine has established is a superficial political stability. Moreover, the happy ending is marred by the corpses dispersed about the stage (those of Bajazeth and Zabina, and that of the King of Arabia) and by the picture of horror in the background (the ruined city of Damascus, with the inhabitants killed to satisfy the whim of Tamburlaine). Therefore, the scene of triumph on which the play ends is colored by a glaring irony.

V

In dealing with Marlowe, it is impossible to seperate the poet from the dramatist, the man from his protagonists. His personality does not retire, like Shakespeare, behind the work of art into obscure mystery. Like Byron, he inspires his protagonists with the ardor, the ambition, the audacity of his own restless genius. Tamburlaine, who defies heaven, and harnesses kings and princes of the East to his chariot, who

ascends his throne upon the neck of prostrate emperors, embodies the insolence of his creator's spirit. It is true Marlowe asks us in the Prologue to form our own opinion about Tamburlaine, but the play does not offer a neutral treatment of him. As we have seen, his seemingly effortless victories by his rhetoric astonish us, and the magnificiently expressed lyric found in his speeches wins our admiration, but we are disgusted by the harmful results of his titanic ambition. Likewise, the symbol of key scenes (for example, the black costume and flags when the innocent vigrins are killed) provokes an antipathetic response toward him. In short, the language of spectacle strongly contradicts the meaning of the protagonist's words; the auditory imagery (the similes and metaphors that we hear) and the visual imagery (costume, action, etc.) conflict with each other and produce an image of man that is contradictory. Therefore, the dramatist relies on visual effects, on dramatic metaphor and symbol, to expose the hollowness of Tamburlaine's rhetoric and to demonstrate the monstrosity of his actions, but he avoids the didactic point of view that will induce our condemnation of Tamburlaine, and he requires us, it seems, to determine the evil reality hidden by the protagonist's daring and enticing language. The first part of Tamburlaine the Great resembles, as it were, a modern film about an unbelievably successful gangster. Because the protagonist lives outside the law, exults in the use of violence, and establishes a huge empire, he appeals to our fantasies of uninhibited power and satisfies our craving for an exciting, romantic life; but his behavior outrages our moral sense. In the Elizabethan age, there was the appeal to the war-atmosphere, expecting great deeds. There was the contemporary value set upon individual, heroic achievements, as with a Drake or Philip Sydney, the belief in energy and initiative, in a man carving out his way for himself and expecting to enjoy his reward. Probably members of the Elizabethan audience saw themselves in the part of Tamburlaine, as its creator did.

It is said that Marlowe never had any of the countryman's natural respect for hierarchy and degree, nor any traditional feeling for the sacred aura surrounding royalty. He was not a traditionalist, and there was no reverence for anything or anybody in his composition. In Marlowe's universe man was himself alone; everything was for him to make or mar; he was lord of himself and of his own fate. Considering these attributes of Marlowe's, it may be said that though the dramatist finds the material for his art in the thrilling career of a Mongolian warrior, his real subject is man's aggressive impulse to achieve total, godlike power.

NOTES

¹This section of our discussion is heavily indebted to J.A. Symonds' remarks. See Symonds, Shakespeare's Predecessors in the English Drama (New York: Cooper Publishers, 1967), p. 467. F. P. Wilson, Marlowe and the Early Skakespeare, (Oxford U. P., 1951), p. 14, also says, "The production of Marlowe's Tamburlaine the Great, Part I, in London, probably in the summer of 1587, inagurated a new era in English drama..."

²W. L. Godshalk, *The Marlovian World Picture* (Mouton, 1974), p. 8, says, "Although scholars are becoming increasingly aware of the tenuous evidence upon which the

present order has been built, still it has become 'standard' to see *Dido*, *I and 2 Tamburlaine* as 'early' plays, and *The Jew of Malta*, *The Massacre at Paris*, and *Edward II* as 'late'. Only *Faustus* seems to be disputed."

³Douglas Cole, Suffering and Evil in the Plays of Christopher Marlowe (Princeton: Princeton U. P., 1692), pp. 62-63.

⁴The Complete Works of Christopher Marlowe (Vol.1): Tamburlaine Part 1I, edited by Fredson Bowers (Cambridge U. P., 1973), Prologue, 1-5. Subsequent quotations from the two parts of Tamburlaine the Great will refer to this edition.

⁵P. H. Kocher, Christopher Marlowe; A Study of His Thought, Learning, and Character (Russell & Russell, 1962), pp. 69-70. D. Cole and F. P. Wilson have the same opinions as Kocher. See Kocher, op. cit., pp. 86-87 and F. P. Wilson, op. cit., pp. 18-19.

⁶A. L. Rowse, *Christopher Marlowe*; His Life and Work (New York: Harper & Row, 1964), p. 57.

7ibid

8Godshalk calls this play monodrama'. See Godshalk, op. cit., p. 102.

⁹Harry Levin, The Overreacher (Harvard U. P., 1952), p. 30

¹⁰Charles G. Masinton, Christopher Marlowe's Tragic Vision (Ohio U. P., 1971), p. 20. ¹¹I. ii. 38.

12 Masinton, op. cit., p.21.

¹³I. ii. 174-175.

¹⁴II. iii. 7.

¹⁵II. iv. 8.

¹⁶II. v. **49**.

¹⁷Masinton, op. cit., p. 26. The following section of our discussion is heavily indebted to Masinton's remarks. See Masinton, op. cit., pp. 26-27.

¹⁸*ibid*., 27.

¹⁹III. iii. 131.

²⁰See Cole, *op. cit.*, p. 76.

²¹Rowse, op. cit., p. 64.

22Masinton, op. cit., p 30.

²³Rowse, op. cit., p. 64.

24V. i. 484.

25See Masinton, op. cit., p. 34.

²⁶This section of our discussion is heavily indebted to Rowse's remarks. See Rowse, op. cit., p. 60.

(昭和55年9月1日受理)